# A Note on the Reliability Function for M-ary PSK Coherent State Signal

# Kentaro Kato

Quantum Communication Research Center, Quantum ICT Research Institute, Tamagawa University 6-1-1 Tamagawa-gakuen, Machida, Tokyo 194-8610, Japan

Tamagawa University Quantum ICT Research Institute Bulletin, Vol.8, No.1, 21-25, 2018

©Tamagawa University Quantum ICT Research Institute 2018

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means electrically, mechanically, by photocopying or otherwise, without prior permission of the copy right owner.

# A Note on the Reliability Function for M-ary PSK Coherent State Signal

Kentaro Kato

Quantum Communication Research Center, Quantum ICT Research Institute, Tamagawa University 6-1-1 Tamagawa-gakuen, Machida, Tokyo 194-8610, Japan E-mail: kkatop@lab.tamagawa.ac.jp

Abstract-In the literature [23], simple expressions of the random coding and the expurgation exponents for Mary phase shift keying (PSK) coherent state signal were respectively derived, and their numerical behaviors are illustrated. In this article, a simple expression of the spherepacking exponent for M-ary PSK coherent state signal is derived, based on the formula of the sphere-packing exponent for classical-quantum channels by Dalai [18], [19]. Using the simple expression, the case of 16-PSK is numerically computed as an example for a better understanding of how the exact value of the reliability function at high rates is determined.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

The channel coding theorem for classical-quantum channels is one of the central theorems in quantum information theory [1], [2]. Remarkable results in the early days of the study on this theorem can be found in the literatures [3], [4], [5], [6]. In 1996, a significant breakthrough on the channel coding theorem for classical-quantum channels was brought by Hasuladen, Jozsa, Schumacher, Westmoreland, and Wootters [7]. They proved the channel coding theorem for discrete classical-quantum channels with pure states. Shortly thereafter, the channel coding theorem for discrete classical-quantum channels with general states was proved by Holevo [8] and by Schumacher and Westmorelandand [9], independently. Further, this result was extended to channels with constrained inputs by Holevo [10] and the capacity of quantum Gaussian states was calculated by Holevo, Sohma, and Hirota [11].

The proof mentioned above is based on the asymptotic property of typical sequences. Like in the case of classical information theory [12], [13], [14], an alternative approach based on the *reliability function* E(R), which tells us how quickly the decoding error  $P_{\rm e}$  vanishes at rates R below the channel capacity C in the codeword length N with the form  $P_{\rm e} \approx {\rm e}^{-NE(R)}$ , has begun to be investigated in quantum scenario. The random coding exponent  $E_r(R)$  (which is a lower bound of the reliability function), the expurgation exponent  $E_{ex}(R)$ (a lower bound), and the zero-rate reliability function E(+0) for classical-quantum channel with pure states were formulated in the literature [15] by Burnashev and Holevo. This successfully provides an alternative proof of the channel coding theorem for classical-quantum channel with pure states. The general version of the

random coding exponent  $E_r(R)$  was conjectured in the literature [15], but still open. The general version of the expurgation exponent  $E_{ex}(R)$  can be found in the literature [16] by Holevo. The error exponents,  $E_r(R)$ ,  $E_{ex}(R)$ , and E(+0), for constrained inputs, in particular, for the quantum Gaussian channel in one mode, were precisely investigated in the literature [17] by Holevo, Sohma, and Hirota. As for upper bounds of the reliability function, significant progress was made by Dalai. He gave a formulation of the sphere-packing exponent  $E_{sp}(R)$  for discrete classical-quantum channels with general states in line with Shannon-Gallager-Berlekamp's approach [18], [19], and proposed a new framework for lower bound of the decoding error at low rates via the zero-error capacity [19]. Further discussions on the sphere-packing exponent and the associated decoding error bound can be found in the literatures [20], [21], [22].

By the parallel use of Dalai's formula of the spherepacking exponent  $E_{sp}(R)$  and Burnashev-Holevo's formula of the random coding exponent  $E_r(R)$ , the reliability function E(R) for pure state channels at high rates was exactly determined. In the literature [23] by the author, simple expressions of the random coding and the expurgation exponents for M-ary phase shift keying (PSK) coherent state signal were reported. As an extension of this preceding work, the derivation of a simple expression of the sphere-packing exponent  $E_{sp}(R)$  for *M*-ary PSK is of natural interest as well as computation of the exact value of the reliability function for M-ary PSK by the parallel use of the random coding exponent and it. In line with this interest, a simple expression of the sphere-packing exponent  $E_{sp}(R)$  for M-ary PSK will be shown and a numerical calculation of the reliability function E(R) will be done in the case of 16-PSK coherent state signal.

# II. A DISCRETE CLASSICAL-QUANTUM CHANNEL WITH PURE STATES

Consider a discrete classical-quantum channel with pure states,  $k \in \mathcal{A} \mapsto |\psi_k\rangle \in \mathcal{B}$ , having an input alphabet  $\mathcal{A} = \{1, 2, \dots, M\}$  and an output alphabet  $\mathcal{B} = \{ |\psi_1\rangle, |\psi_2\rangle, \cdots, |\psi_M\rangle \}$  that consists of M state vectors in a Hilbert space  $\mathcal{H}$  under consideration. A prior probability distribution  $\mathbf{p} = (p_1, p_2, \dots, p_M)$  on the input alphabet A corresponds to coding for this channel. According to the channel coding theorem for pure state channels [7], [15], the channel capacity for this discrete classical-quantum channel with pure states is given by

$$C = \max_{\mathbf{p}} \left[ H(\sum_{k=1}^{M} p_k |\psi_k\rangle \langle \psi_k |) \right], \tag{1}$$

where  $H(\hat{\rho}) \equiv -\text{Tr}\hat{\rho}\ln\hat{\rho}$  is the von Neumann entropy for a density operator  $\hat{\rho}$ .

The reliability function is defined by

$$E(R) \equiv \limsup_{N \to \infty} \left[ \frac{-\ln P_{\rm e}(N, R)}{N} \right]$$
(2)

for 0 < R < C, where N is the length of a codeword, R the transmission rate, and  $P_{\rm e}(N, R)$  the minimum probability of decoding error. For a discrete classical-quantum channel with pure states, the minimum probability of decoding error can be written as

$$P_{\rm e}(N,R) = \inf_{\mathbb{W},\mathbb{X}} \left[ \frac{1}{M'} \sum_{i=1}^{M'} (1 - \langle \tilde{\mathbf{W}}_i | \hat{\mathbf{X}}_i | \tilde{\mathbf{W}}_i \rangle) \right], \quad (3)$$

where  $\mathbb{W}$  is a codebook defined by

$$\mathbb{W} = \left\{ |\tilde{\mathbf{W}}_i\rangle = |\psi_i^{(1)}\rangle \otimes |\psi_i^{(2)}\rangle \otimes \cdots \otimes |\psi_i^{(N)}\rangle \\
: i = 1, 2, \dots, M', \ |\psi_i^{(n)}\rangle \in \mathcal{B} \right\}, \quad (4)$$

and M' is the size of the codebook, and where the decoding process X is represented by a positive operator-valued measure (POVM)

$$\mathbb{X} = \left\{ \hat{\mathbf{X}}_j : \ \hat{\mathbf{X}}_j \ge 0 \ \forall j, \ \sum_{\text{all } j} \hat{\mathbf{X}}_j = \hat{1}^{(N)} \right\},$$
(5)

and  $\hat{1}^{(N)}$  is the identity operator on the *N*-th tensor of the signal Hilbert space  $\mathcal{H}^{\otimes N}$ .

### III. ERROR EXPONENTS FOR *M*-ARY PSK COHERENT STATE SIGNAL

From this point, let us focus on the case of M-ary PSK coherent state signal, which is characterized by the output alphabet

$$\mathcal{B} = \left\{ |\psi_k\rangle = |\alpha \exp[\mathbf{i}\frac{2\pi(k-1)}{M}] \right\}$$
$$: k = 1, 2, \dots, M \right\}, \quad (6)$$

where  $|\alpha\rangle$  is a coherent state of light having complex amplitude  $\alpha$  and  $\mathbf{i} = \sqrt{-1}$ . The average number of photons per signal for *M*-ary PSK is given by  $|\alpha|^2$ , which is independent from the number *M*.

### A. The Random Coding Exponent

According to the literature [23], a simple expression of the random coding exponent for M-ary PSK is given by

$$E_r(R) = \left(-\ln\sum_{k=1}^M \lambda_k^2\right) - R \tag{7}$$

for  $0 < R < R_{cr}$ , and

$$E_r(R) = \max_{0 \le s \le 1} \left[ \left( -\ln \sum_{k=1}^M \lambda_k^{1+s} \right) - sR \right]$$
(8)

for  $R_{cr} \leq R < C$ , where the critical rate  $R_{cr}$  of the random coding exponent and the channel capacity C are respectively given by

$$R_{cr} = -\frac{\sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k^2 \ln \lambda_k}{\sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k^2}$$
(9)

and

$$C = -\sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k \ln \lambda_k, \qquad (10)$$

and where the eigenvalues of the density operator  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u}) = (1/M) \sum_{k=1}^{M} |\psi_k\rangle \langle \psi_k |$  for the uniform distribution  $\mathbf{u} = (1/M, \dots, 1/M)$  on  $\mathcal{A}$  are given by

$$\lambda_k = \frac{1}{M} \sum_{\ell=1}^M A_{(1,\ell)} \cos\left[\Theta_{(1,\ell)} - \frac{2\pi}{M}k(\ell-1)\right]$$
(11)

with

$$A_{(k,\ell)} = \exp\left[-2|\alpha|^2 \sin^2\left[\frac{\pi}{M}(\ell-k)\right]\right], \qquad (12)$$

$$\Theta_{(k,\ell)} = |\alpha|^2 \sin\left[\frac{2\pi}{M}(\ell-k)\right].$$
(13)

# B. The Expurgation Exponent

From the literature [23], a simple expression of the expurgation exponent for *M*-ary PSK is given by

$$E_{ex}(R) = \max_{s \ge 1} \left[ -sR \qquad (14) - s\ln\frac{1}{M} \sum_{\ell=1}^{M} \exp\left[ -\frac{4|\alpha|^2}{s} \tilde{z}_{(1,\ell)} \right] \right]$$

for  $0 < R \leq R'_{cr}$ , and

$$E_{ex}(R) = -\ln\frac{1}{M} \sum_{\ell=1}^{M} \exp\left[-4|\alpha|^2 \tilde{z}_{(1,\ell)}\right] - R \quad (15)$$

for  $R'_{cr} < R < R_c$ , and  $E_{ex}(R) = 0$  for  $R_c \le R < C$ , where the critical rate  $R'_{cr}$  of the expurgation exponent and the cutoff rate  $R_c$  [24] are respectively given by

$$R'_{cr} = -\ln \sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k^2$$

$$- \frac{4|\alpha|^2}{M} \cdot \frac{\sum_{\ell=1}^{M} \tilde{z}_{(1,\ell)} \exp[-4|\alpha|^2 \tilde{z}_{(1,\ell)}]}{\sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k^2}$$
(16)

and

$$R_c = -\ln\frac{1}{M}\sum_{\ell=1}^{M} \exp[-4|\alpha|^2 \tilde{z}_{(1,\ell)}]$$
(17)

with  $\tilde{z}_{(k,\ell)} = \sin^2[\pi(\ell - k)/M].$ 

# C. The Sphere-Packing Exponent

The general formulation of the sphere-packing exponent for classical-quantum channels is given in the literatures [18], [19]. For a pure state alphabet  $\mathcal{B} = \{|\psi_k\rangle : 1 \leq k \leq M\}$ , the sphere-packing exponent is reduced into the form

$$E_{sp}(R) = \sup_{s \ge 0} [E_0(s) - sR]$$
(18)

for  $R_{\infty} < R < C$ , where

$$E_0(s) = \max_{\mathbf{p}} E_0(s, \mathbf{p}), \tag{19}$$

$$E_0(s, \mathbf{p}) = -\ln \operatorname{Tr}\left(\sum_k p_k |\psi_k\rangle \langle \psi_k|\right)^{1+\delta}$$
(20)

and where

$$R_{\infty} = -\ln\min_{\mathbf{p}} \lambda_{\max}(\sum_{k} p_{k} |\psi_{k}\rangle \langle \psi_{k}|) \qquad (21)$$

and  $\lambda_{\max}(\cdot)$  denotes the largest eigenvalue of the argument. Our task is to derive a simple expression of the sphere-packing exponent for *M*-ary PSK.

As shown in Eq.(19), the formula of the sphere-packing exponent involves the maximization problem with respect to the input distribution **p**. Fortunately, the problem is the same as in the case of random coding exponent. With the same manner used in the literature [23], one can find that the maximizer of this problem for *M*-ary PSK is the uniform distribution  $\mathbf{u} = (1/M, \dots, 1/M)$ . Therefore, the sphere-packing exponent for *M*-ary PSK coherent state signal is expressed as

$$E_{sp}(R) = \max_{s \ge 0} \left[ \left( -\ln \sum_{k=1}^{M} \lambda_k^{1+s} \right) - sR \right]$$
(22)

for  $R_{\infty} < R < C$ , where the rate  $R_{\infty}$  is formulated as in Eq.(21) and the channel capacity C has been given by Eq.(10). To find the closed-form expression of  $R_{\infty}$  for M-ary PSK, we use the convexity of the largest eigenvalue of density operators of the output states. The convexity of the largest eigenvalue is a wellknown property (*e.g.* [25]). To verify this property in our situation, let us define  $F(\hat{\rho}) \equiv \lambda_{\max}(\hat{\rho})$ , where  $\lambda_{\max}(\hat{\rho})$ denotes the largest eigenvalue of a density operator  $\hat{\rho}$ . For density operators  $\hat{\rho}_1$  and  $\hat{\rho}_2$ , we observe  $F(\hat{\rho}_1)\hat{1} - \hat{\rho}_1 \ge 0$ and  $F(\hat{\rho}_2)\hat{1} - \hat{\rho}_2 \ge 0$ , respectively. Therefore

$$\left\{tF(\hat{\rho}_1) + (1-t)F(\hat{\rho}_2)\right\}\hat{1} - \left\{t\hat{\rho}_1 + (1-t)\hat{\rho}_2\right\} \ge 0$$

holds for  $0 \le t \le 1$ . Taking a quadratic form of the lefthand side by a normalized eigenvector  $|\varphi\rangle$  belonging to the largest eigenvalue of  $t\hat{\rho}_1 + (1-t)\hat{\rho}_2$ , we have

$$tF(\hat{\rho}_1) + (1-t)F(\hat{\rho}_2) \ge F(t\hat{\rho}_1 + (1-t)\hat{\rho}_2).$$

Thus the function F is a convex function on the set of density operators.

Next, we use this convexity to find the minimizer of Eq.(21) in the case of *M*-ary PSK. For an arbitrary chosen distribution  $\mathbf{p} = (p_1, \dots, p_M)$ , we have

$$F(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p})) = \sum_{m=1}^{M} \frac{1}{M} F(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p}))$$
  
$$= \sum_{m=1}^{M} \frac{1}{M} F(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p}^{(m)}))$$
  
$$\geq F(\sum_{m=1}^{M} \frac{1}{M} \hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p}^{(m)}))$$
  
$$= F(\sum_{k=1}^{M} \frac{1}{M} |\psi_k\rangle \langle \psi_k|)$$
  
$$= F(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u})), \qquad (23)$$

where  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p})$  and  $\mathbf{p}^{(m)}$  are defined as in the literature [23]. Thus the uniform distribution  $\mathbf{u}$  minimizes the largest eigenvalue. Therefore the rate  $R_{\infty}$  for *M*-ary PSK is given by

$$R_{\infty} = -\ln \max\{\lambda_k : 1 \le k \le M\},\tag{24}$$

where  $\lambda_k$  have been given by Eq.(11). Since  $-\ln \lambda_{\max} \leq -\ln \lambda_k$ , we obtain  $R_{\infty} \leq R_{cr}$ .

Fig. 1 (a) shows the rate  $R_{\infty}$  of the case of 16-PSK (M = 16) for  $0 < |\alpha|^2 \le 10$ , and Fig. 1 (b) the associated eigenvalues  $\lambda_k$ ,  $1 \leq k \leq 16$ , of the density operator  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u})$ . In Fig. 1 (b), the envelope curve (black:online) indicates the largest eigenvalue of  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u})$ . The shape of this envelope determines the shape of  $R_{\infty}$  in Fig. 1 (a). To justify the claim that the minimizer of Eq.(21) is the uniform distribution u, a simple numerical simulation was done. In the simulation, the largest eigenvalues of density operators with randomly generated input distribution were calculated. The simulation result is shown in Fig. 1 (c). In this simulation, 30 random samples were generated for each  $|\alpha|^2$ , varying from  $|\alpha|^2 = 0.05$  to  $|\alpha|^2 = 10.00$  with step size 0.05. The solid curve is the largest eigenvalue of  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u})$ , which is identical to the envelope curve in Fig. 1 (b), and the dots (orange:online) are the samples. We numerically observe that the largest eigenvalue of  $\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u})$ is always less than any largest eigenvalue of the density operator having a non-uniform distribution.

# IV. THE RELIABILITY FUNCTION OF M-ARY PSK COHERENT STATE SIGNAL AT A HIGH RATE REGION

Like in the case of classical channel, one can find the exact value of the reliability function of M-ary PSK



Fig. 1. (a)  $R_{\infty}$ . (b)  $\lambda_k$ ,  $1 \leq k \leq 16$ , and  $\lambda_{\max}(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u}))$ . (c)  $\lambda_{\max}(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{u}))$  and  $\lambda_{\max}(\hat{\rho}(\mathbf{p}))$ ,  $\mathbf{p} \neq \mathbf{u}$ .

coherent state signal at a high-rate region,  $R_{cr} < R < C$ , by the sandwich of the random coding and the spherepacking exponents. To illustrate this, the case of M = 16and  $|\alpha|^2 = 0.5$  is shown in Fig. 2. The figure (a) shows the random coding, the expurgation, and the spherepacking exponents. Optimal values of parameter s for the sphere-packing exponent is plotted in Fig. 2 (b), together with the optimal s for the random coding exponent. Fig. 2 (c) shows the optimal s for the expurgation exponent. Some critical values at M = 16 and  $|\alpha|^2 = 0.5$  are shown in Table I. As mentioned in Remark 5 of the

TABLE I Some critical values at M=16 and  $|\alpha|^2=0.5$ 

Rate [bits/symbol]		Exponent in $e^{-nE(R)}$	
C	1.33830	$\sim 0$	
$R_c$	1.10234	> 0	
$R_{cr}$	0.95780	$E(R_{cr})$	0.10029
$R_{\infty}$	0.72135	$E_{sp}(R_{\infty})$	0.50000
$R'_{cr}$	0.30365	$E_r(R'_{cr})$	0.55369
$R \rightarrow +0$		E(+0)	1.00000

literature [19], the bound  $E_{sp}(R_{\infty}) \leq R_{\infty}$  is tight in general, in the sense that  $E_{sp}(R_{\infty}) = R_{\infty}$  is possible. In Table I, we observe  $R_{\infty} = 0.72135 \times \ln(2) = 0.50000$ [nats/symbol]  $\approx E_{sp}(R_{\infty})$ , numerically. The same observation about the tightness was confirmed in the range  $0 < |\alpha|^2 < 10.00$  through a numerical calculation. The curve in the high rate region  $R_{cr} < R < C$  in Fig. 2 (a) is the exact value of the reliability function E(R) of Mary PSK coherent state signal because the upper and the lower bounds of the reliability function are identical in this region. Thus the exact value of the reliability function E(R) for M-ary PSK can be computed from Eqs.(9), (10), and (22). Furthermore, we observe in Fig.2 (a) that the difference between  $E_{sp}(R)$  and  $E_r(R)$  is small in the region of  $R \approx R_{cr}$  when  $R > R_{cr}$ . Therefore, the simplified expression (22) may be used to approximate the exact value of E(R) in the region  $R \gtrsim R_{cr}$ .

### V. CONCLUSION

In this article, a simple expression of the spherepacking exponent  $E_{sp}(R)$  for *M*-ary PSK coherent state signal was derived as in Eq.(22), together with the associated critical rate  $R_{\infty}$  of Eq.(24). Using this simple expression together with Eqs.(9) and (10), the case of 16-PSK coherent state signal was numerically computed to see the exact value of the reliability function E(R)at the high rate region from the critical rate  $R_{cr}$  of the random coding exponent to the chapacity *C*.

#### VI. ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author is grateful to Prof. Masaki Sohma of Tamagawa University and Prof. Kenji Nakahira of Tamagawa University for helpful comments.

#### References

- A. S. Holevo, QUANTUM SYSTEMS, CHANNELS, INFORMATION — A MATHEMATICAL INTRODUCTION, De Gruyter Studies in Mathematical Physics 16, De Gruyter, Berlin/Boston, 2012.
- [2] M. A. Nielsen and I. L. Chuang, QUANTUM COMPUTATION AND QUANTUM INFORMATION, 10th Aniv. Ed., Cambredge Univ. Press, Cambredge, 2010.
- [3] A. S. Holevo, "Information-theoretic aspects of quantum measurement," *Probl. Inf. Transm.*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 110-118, 1973; English transl. from *Probl. Pereda. Inf.*, vol. 9, no. 2, pp. 31-42, Apr.-Jun. 1973.
- [4] A. S. Holevo, "Bounds for the quantity of information transmitted by a quantum communication channel," *Probl. Inf. Transm.*, vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 177-183, 1973; English transl. from *Probl. Pereda. Inf.*, vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 3-11, Jul.-Sep. 1973.



Fig. 2. (a) The random coding exponent, the expurgation exponent, and the zero-rate reliability function for 16-PSK coherent state signal; (b) The optimal s for the random coding exponent; (c) The optimal s for the expurgation exponent.

- [5] R. L. Stratonovich and A. G. Vatsyan, "Asymptotically error-free decoding in pure quantum channels," *Problemy upraveleniya i teorii informatsii (Probl. Control Inf. Theory)*, vol. 7, no. 3, pp. 161-173, 1978.
- [6] A. S. Holevo, "On capacity of a quantum communications channel," *Probl. Inf. Transm.*, vol. 15, no. 4, pp. 247-253, 1979; English transl. from *Probl. Pereda. Inf.*, vol. 15, no. 4, pp. 3-11, Oct.-Dec. 1979.
- [7] P. Hausladen, R. Jozsa, B. Schumacher, M. Westmoreland, and W. Wooters, "Classical information capacity of a quantum channel," *Phys. Rev. A*, vol. 54, iss. 3, pp. 1869-1876, Sep. 1996.
- [8] A. S. Holeve, "The capacity of quantum channel with general signal states," *IEEE Trans. Inf. Theory*, vol.44, iss. 1, pp. 269-273, Jan. 1998; arXiv quant-ph/9611023.

- [9] B. Schumacher and M. D. Westmoreland, "Sending classical information via noisy quantum channel," *Phys. Rev. A*, vol. 56, no.1, pp. 131-138, July 1997.
- [10] A. S. Holevo, "Coding theorems for quantum channels," *Tama-gawa University Research Review*, vol.4, 1998; Extended version: arXiv quant-ph/9809023.
- [11] A. S. Holevo, M. Sohma, and O. Hirota, "Capacity of quantum Gaussian channels," *Phys. Rev. A*, vol. 59, no. 3, pp. 1820-1828, Mar. 1999.
- [12] R. G. Gallager, "A simple derivation of the coding theorem and some applications," *IEEE Trans. Inf. Theory*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 3-18, Jan. 1965.
- [13] C. E. Shannon, R. G. Gallager, and E. R. Berlekamp, "Lower bounds to error probability for coding on discrete memoryless channels. I," *Inf. Control*, vol. 10, iss. 1, pp. 65-103, Jan. 1967.
- [14] C. E. Shannon, R. G. Gallager, and E. R. Berlekamp, "Lower bounds to error probability for coding on discrete memoryless channels. II," *Inf. Control*, vol. 10, iss. 5, pp. 522-552, May 1967.
- [15] M. V. Burnashev and A. S. Holevo, "On reliability function of quantum communication channel," *Probl. Inf. Transm.*, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 97-107, 1998; *Probl. Pereda. Inf.*, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 3-15, 1998.
- [16] A. S. Holevo, "Reliability function of general classical-quantum channel," *IEEE Trans. Inf. Theory*, vol. 46, no. 6, pp. 2256-2261, Sep. 2000.
- [17] A. S. Holevo, M. Sohma, and O. Hirota, "Error exponents for quantum channels with constrained inputs," *Rep. Math. Phys.*, vol. 46, iss. 3, pp. 343-358, Dec. 2000.
- [18] M. Dalai, "Sphere packing bound for quantum channels," Proc. IEEE Int. Symp. Inf. Theory (ISIT), pp. 160-164, Jul. 2012.
- [19] M. Dalai, "Lower bounds on the probability of error for classical and classical-quantum channels," *IEEE Trans. Inf. Theory*, vol. 59, no. 12, pp. 8027-8056, Dec. 2013.
- [20] M. Dalai, "Some remarks on classical and classical-quantum sphere packing bounds: Rényi vs. Kullback-Leibler," *Entropy*, vol. 19, iss. 7, 355, 2017.
- [21] H.-C. Cheng, M.-H. Hsieh, and M. Tomamichel, "Sphere-packing bound for symmetric classical-quantum channels," *Proc. IEEE Int. Symp. Inf. Theory (ISIT)*, 2017 IEEE International Symposium on Information Theory (ISIT), pp. 286-290, Jun. 2017.
- [22] H.-C. Cheng, M.-H. Hsieh, and M. Tomamichel, "Sphere-packing bound for classical-quantum channels," *Proc. IEEE Inf. Theory Workshop (ITW)*, 2017 IEEE Information Theory Workshop (ITW 2017 Kaohsiung), pp. 479-483, Nov. 2017.
- [23] K. Kato, "Error exponents of quantum communication system with M-ary PSK coherent state signal," *Tamagawa University Quantum ICT Research Institute Bulletin 2011*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 33-40, Dec. 2011.
- [24] M. Ban, K. Kurokawa, and O. Hirota, "Cut-off rate performance of quantum communication channels with symmetric signal states," *J. Opt. B: Quant. Semiclass. Opt.*, vol.1, no. 2, pp. 206-218, 1999.
- [25] A. W. Marshall, I. Olkin, and B. C. Arnold, INEQUALITIES: THEORY OF MAJORIZATION AND ITS APPLICATIONS, 2nd ed., Springer, New York, 2011.